MINUTES OF THE HERITAGE PRESERVATION COMMISSION

CITY OF SAINT PAUL, MINNESOTA

Lower Level – Room 41, City Hall/Court House, 15 West Kellogg Boulevard **December 16, 2010**

Present: Robert Ferguson, Jennifer Haskamp, Pat Igo, Rich Laffin, John Manning, Matt

Mazanec, Mark Thomas, Steve Trimble

Absent: Lee Meyer (unexcused), David Riehle (excused), Diane Trout-Oertel (unexcused)

Staff Present: Amy Spong, Christine Boulware,

BUSINESS MEETING

CALL TO ORDER: 5:10 PM by John Manning (Chair)

I. APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA: The agenda was approved as presented.

II. CONFLICT OF INTEREST: None stated

III. CHAIR'S ANNOUNCEMENTS:

A. Commissioner Igo is leaving the HPC. There will be an informal gathering at a local restaurant after the public hearing.

IV. STAFF ANNOUNCEMENTS

- **A.** The HPC was awarded a \$7000 Legacy Grant to complete the designation and design guidelines for the Jacob Schmidt Brewing Company Historic District.
- **B.** Received and reviewed many applications for appointments to the HPC. There are three seats to fill. The new appointments will be on the January 5 City Council agenda.

V. PUBLIC HEARING/PERMIT REVIEW

A. 333 Maiden Lane, Hill Historic District, by Erin & John Mathern, for a building permit to rehabilitate the building. File #11-008 (Spong 266-6714) Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Mazanec noted the chimney was not on the plans. Ferguson clarified the use of footing versus wall cap. He also noted that three-over-one windows were showing on the plans and drew attention to finding number 3. Staff noted they missed the detail in the review. Laffin added the window change was identified and asked about the gable returns. Staff indicated the details could be verified by the applicant. John and Erin Mathern, applicants, and Tom Blanck, architect and owner, were present to discuss the project. J. Mathern explained they have been discussing the project for six months and have a purchase agreement. Blanck gave a history of the building and noted plans and photos were brought to the hearing for reference. He stated the building is well worth saving and its condition is due to materials being pushed against it. J. Mathern stated they will stabilize and straighten the walls and remodel the building into a single-family home. E. Mathern stated she had looked at the building several times over the past twothree years and learned a lot about its history. She plans to preserve the building's character while transitioning it from its past use as a livery to a residence. Manning asked it they had any reaction to the staff recommendations. J. Mathern stated they did not have any issued and the fence could be changed to 4 ft. or lower and visually open. Laffin asked about changes to the main level windows. Blanck explained that the original entrance to the building was from the south. The plan is to keep a design that reinforces the original use of the building. On the inside you can still see where seven horses were stabled. They will introduce a window that may have originally existed and add a central door for use. Blanck added that he

believes the original elevations were symmetrical. Laffin asked which windows would be repaired. Black replied that all will be replaced except for the gable windows. The windows to be replaced didn't have architectural character, but are just functional, one-over-one double-hung sash.

Blanck stated that the chimney is original. A horseman lived on the second floor and a cast iron stove in the tack room heated the space. The plan is to remove the chimney, as a stairway is planned in its current location. Manning asked if they would consider preserving the chimney above the roofline. Blanck replied the chimney may be beyond re-pointing, but could be replicated as a decorative detail. Staff asked if the lower portion of the chimney was parged. Blanck replied it was repaired with mortar and they haven't conducted any analysis to see if it could be repaired. Staff noted that the chimney is an important element, especially when decorative. Some chimneys have been kept above the roofline when no longer in use. In reviewing its removal, the decorative details and visibility need to be taken into consideration. Blanck added that the client would like a fireplace, but not in that location and asked if the HPC would consider a chimney in a new location. Mazanec asked if there had been a decision made about the gable returns. Blanck replied he believes they are original and would prefer to put them back. E. Mathern stated her preference to reinstall the gable returns. Mazanec inquired about the large carriage stone at the west elevation. Blanck replied that he had put it there and it was part of the wall that had collapsed at 318 Summit Avenue. Laffin asked if the applicant had considered installing a cedar shingle roof. J. Mathern stated he is not a fan due to the quality of the material and hadn't considered it. He stated he planned to use Timberline asphalt shingles. Blanck informed that a cedar roof would add \$35,000 to the cost and only last 20 years. Laffin and Blanck discussed installing colored metal valleys and burying the utilities. J. Mathern added that they would be boring the water service in from Farrington. There was discussion about the location of the air conditioner unit and preserving the interior spaces from installing utilities.

Mark Voerding, 113 Farrington, commended the new owners for their efforts and investment. He stated concern about a fence along Maiden Lane and asked the owners to look into an easement that 107 Farrington has to access their rear yard. Mazanec motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations adding the following conditions:

- 1. Details of the condition of the chimney shall be submitted to staff. Staff will review the information and decide how to proceed with either repair or replication in a new location.
- 2. The reconstruction of the missing gable returns is encouraged. Ferguson seconded the motion. Staff asked for instruction about reconstruction needing to match or be similar to original. Mazanec replied near replication is okay. Laffin asked about paint colors. Thomas noted that little had changed at the property since 1904, so the area will be looking a feeling of the past in exchange for the gain. Igo stated an easement would appear in transfer of the title. The motion passed 8-0.
- **B. 685-687 Fourth Street East**, by Historic Saint Paul, for a building permit for rehabilitation of the residence, site improvements and the construction of a two-stall garage. File #11-009 (Boulware, 266-6715)

 Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Mazanec asked about

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Mazanec asked about the Bott House. Laffin added corrections to change rock to block in staff recommendation #1 and asked if the applicant had considered the installation of a continuous ridge-vent. Ferguson noted that staff recommendation #4 is the same as the applicant's alternate.

Carol Carey, Historic Saint Paul (applicant), Sheri Pemberton-Hoiby PED/HRA (owner) and Ellen Biales, Ward 7 Aide, were present to discuss the proposal.

Carey stated they are in the pre-development stage and have been in close communication with staff. She concurred with the staff findings and recommendation. Laffin stated the garages are "delightful, simple structures" and asked if the window in the gable meant there was usable space. Carey replied it would be for storage. Laffin asked if the garage doors would be wood or steel and expressed concern for the muntin profile in the lites. Carey replied the garage doors will be wood. Pemberton-Hoiby stated they will bid alternates. Laffin stated that wood doors look better and staff asked if they had looked into fiberglass products.

Mazanec stated that as a neighbor he is excited about the Fourth Street Project and asked about the timeline. Pemberton-Hoiby stated the plans will be completed in January 2011, go to bid in February, and start work in March. The plan is to have them on the fall tour and bring the 695 Fourth Street East and 326 Maria to the HPC in February for review. Manning asked it they will retain the front doors. Carey replied, yes. Thomas suggested looking into architectural salvage. Igo stated he likes the floor plans and the layout of the first floor is good marketing. Pemberton-Hoiby replied they had worked with realtors. Ferguson stated the garages had worked out well and the design speaks to the spirit of the neighborhood.

Mazanec motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations. Ferguson seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

C. 693 Fourth Street East, by Historic Saint Paul, for a building permit for rehabilitation of the residence, the demolition of the accessory building, site improvements and the construction on a one-stall garage. File #11-010 (Boulware, 266-6715)

Staff read the report recommending conditional approval. Mazanec asked about the use of the out building. Staff replied it had been a chicken coop. Thomas inquired about the condition of the building. Staff replied it was good and gave a description of the materials.

Carol Carey, Sheri Pemberton-Hoiby and Ellen Biales were present to discuss the proposal. Carey stated she concurs with the findings and agrees with the staff recommendation. Thomas asked if it would be possible to reuse the out building. Manning asked if it could be moved to another location. Carey replied they would consider allowing someone to move it. Laffin stated contractors could remove and sell the building. Ferguson mentioned that keeping chickens has become popular. Mazanec asked that the coop be offered to the neighborhood.

Carey informed that an alternate to keeping the aluminum soffit is to remove the aluminum and repair/replace materials underneath, but it will be an economic decision. Laffin stated there are cement-fiber soffit products.

Mazanec motioned to approve the application with staff recommendations and add that the applicant explore reusing/repurposing the chicken coop. Thomas seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

VI. NEW BUSINESS

VII. COMMITTEE REPORTS – No reports were given.

- **A.** Education Committee (Ferguson, Thomas, Trout-Oertel)
- **B.** Lowertown Master Plan Steering Committee (Ferguson)
- **C.** Saint Paul Historic Survey Partnership Project (Trimble)
- **D.** Public Safety Building Mitigation (Penfield) (Manning, Igo)
- **E.** 3M Advisory Committee/Workgroups update (Trimble, Mazanec)

VIII. ADJOURN: 6:45

Submitted by: C. Boulware